

ITEM NO. 10**COMMITTEE DATE:**

14/03/2016

APPLICATION NO:

16/0010/03

FULL PLANNING PERMISSION

APPLICANT:Mr Barnes
EFHL Property**PROPOSAL:****LOCATION:**

The Lodge, 22 Spicer Road, Exeter, EX1 1SZ

REGISTRATION DATE:

18/12/2015

EXPIRY DATE:

12/02/2016



Scale 1:100

This map is based on Ordnance Survey material with the permission of Ordnance Survey on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office ? Crown copyright. Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Exeter City Council 100049053

HISTORY OF SITE

02/0786/03 -	Two storey extension and alterations to provide additional accommodation and ancillary offices to include demolition of existing wings of building	PER	08/10/2002
02/0914/14 -	Demolition of wings of main building on north side and rear of existing building, bungalow and outbuildings known as No. 18 Spicer Road and garage adjacent to No 21 College Road	PER	08/10/2002
03/1542/03 -	Two storey extension to provide additional accommodation, ancillary offices and demolition of existing wing of building and 18 Spicer Road	PER	03/11/2003
05/1233/03 -	Alterations to include repositioning of south and east corner boundary wall/railings (2.1 m max height) to create 10 additional parking spaces, lighting and detached glazed shelter on north east elevation	PER	07/12/2005
12/1487/03 -	Two storey extension to provide 11 additional bedrooms including ancillary accommodation and	PER	20/12/2012

DESCRIPTION OF SITE/PROPOSAL

The Lodge is a Victorian Villa dating from 1888. Red brick with pitched slate roof, it is three storeys in height, with wooden sash windows and bays with mouldings and is Locally Listed. Part of the site is located within the St. Leonards Conservation Area. Permission was granted in 1957 for the use of the 'Lodge' as a residential home. The site is located on the eastern side of Spicer Road opposite The Maynard School and extends to the rear along College Road.

The original Victorian building is located in the south western part of the site fronting Spicer Road. The home was then extended to the South-East (Robeson Wing) followed by an extension to the south (Rainbow Wing) in 1984. The most recent expansion is Spicer Wing in early 2000, to the North-East of the original building.

Communal gardens extend to the south of the Rainbow wing along College Road with a car parking area accessed from the bottom of Spicer Road opposite the Mount Radford Public House.

A three storey extension to the Rainbow wing is proposed, of approximately 20.5m x 13.0m x 8.0m to eaves and 11.8m to ridge, to provide 14 bedrooms and two x 2 person suites at lower ground level facing the gardens. Some minor excavation of the garden would be required. Access to the bedroom levels will be from the existing Rainbow wing and a new lift will also be provided. This will increase the home's floor area by 691 sq.m. Materials will reflect those used elsewhere on the buildings on the site.

In addition, the existing conservatory to the Robeson wing (in the centre of the site) will be replaced by a larger, part glazed, function room to provide additional social space. The extension of approximately 10.5m x 12.0m x 3.0m to top of parapet and 3.8m the top of the glazed roof, will increase the floor area by 31 sq.m. This will be principally glazing with brick plinth and piers.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE APPLICANT

A Design and Access Statement has been submitted.

The property provides personal and nursing care in 46 high quality bedrooms each with en-suite facilities. They are registered with the Care Quality Commission with a 3-star excellent rating. The new wing is a response to increased demand for rooms at the home. 14 bedrooms and 2no two person flats will be provided. The existing Robeson Wing sitting room conservatory will be replaced by a larger function room to provide more generous social space for residents.

The agents have also responded to a number of issues raised in the objections by providing additional information.

REPRESENTATIONS

7 representations have been received; along with one letter which raises no objections. Concerns raised relate to:

- impact upon neighbours in College Road opposite, through overlooking and shadowing;
- overshadowing of buildings opposite;
- Building out of scale with others in street, which will be detrimental to the character of street;
- Additional intrusive light pollution from the building affecting properties opposite;
- Loss of light, privacy and views;
- Loss of green space (and for residents);
- Issues with parking, traffic and construction work;

- Noise during construction works;
- Accommodation of additional staff parking etc;
- Devalues properties opposite;
- Turning College Road into a business road rather than residential.

CONSULTATIONS

SWWA: - No objections (foul flows to public sewers only).

EHO: - Approval with conditions re Construction/demolition hours and plant noise.

Devon County Highways: - Any car trips from residents are considered to be negligible. The site is in a sustainable location close to the City Centre with nearby bus services. The existing car, and disabled car, parking is anticipated to adequately support the current and proposed use of the site. A condition is recommended regarding construction traffic due to the close proximity to a school.

PLANNING POLICIES/POLICY GUIDANCE

Central Government Guidance - National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

There is a presumption in favour of sustainable development

Exeter Local Development Framework Core Strategy

CP17 - Design and Local Distinctiveness

Exeter Local Plan First Review 1995-2011

DG1 - Objectives of Urban Design

DG4 - Residential Layout and Amenity

C1 - Conservation Areas

C3 - Buildings of Local Importance

T10 - Car Parking Standards

Exeter City Council Supplementary Planning Document

Residential Design Guide (adopted September 2010)

St Leonard's Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan (March 2008)

OBSERVATIONS

The property is a well established care home providing good quality accommodation for residents. Half of the property, along the Spicer Road frontage, including the 'original' building which is on the 'Local List', is located within the St. Leonards Conservation Area, however the buildings along the College Road frontage are not. Although the properties on the east side of College Road have some quality they were not of sufficient merit to justify inclusion in the St. Leonards Conservation Area when it was last reviewed in 2008. The new three storey extension would be at least 23 metres away from the rear of the 'original' Victorian property and separated by a communal area, the majority of which is not in the conservation area. The proposal will therefore not have an adverse effect upon the main building or the character and appearance of the conservation area.

The proposed three storey addition will be on the same building line along the west side of College Road as the existing buildings, set back approximately 6.0 metres from the roadside boundary and 22 metres from the front elevation of properties opposite. The extension will have an eaves height similar to that on properties opposite but the agents have been asked to provide a cross section to show this. This is the same situation as that between the existing 'Rainbow' wing and properties opposite which was considered to be acceptable. It is difficult to argue that the situation is any different in this case, especially with regard to loss of privacy and amenity. With regards to sunlight, a sun path study has been submitted indicating that due to the orientation of the proposal with existing properties opposite, any significant impact is only likely to occur in the late evening during the summer months.

The design of the extension does not copy that of the 'Rainbow' addition, but nevertheless still reflects design elements of this and other additions to the main property. It is located in the part of the site not within the conservation area and will not look out of place in this

context. The design was changed to a hipped roof (from a gable end roof) following discussion with officers, as this reduces the overall mass of the building and will tie in to the existing building design more successfully.

The existing parking areas will not be affected by the proposals. Devon County Highways considers the existing parking arrangements will be adequate to serve the current and proposed development. However, the applicants have indicated that the anticipated uplift in staffing would be a maximum of 7 persons at any one time so have revisited the existing car parking areas and identified areas, by reconfiguring spaces, where seven additional spaces can be created. They are also going to raise the awareness of staff to opportunities for walking, cycling (provision to be made on site), public transport and car sharing. These measures can be made the subject of a condition.

The applicants have confirmed that they will review all areas of open space/amenity areas on site and will provide additional tree planting. They have also indicated that potentially the garden of No. 22 College Road could be integrated into the demise of the care home.

The applicants indicate, in response to concerns over light pollution, that presence detectors can be provided in stairwells and any external lighting to the perimeter of the extension facing College Road, which would also save energy. With regards to privacy concerns they suggest the use of sheers (net curtains) to windows will mitigate this but also point out that the distance between the windows is 22 metres which conforms with accepted standards.

Concerns over the loss of views and the impact upon the value of properties are not issues that can be taken into account when determining planning applications.

A smaller part of the scheme, which has not resulted in any adverse reaction to it, is for the replacement of a conservatory attached to the Robeson wing with a larger, part glazed, function room. This will be erected in the existing courtyard to the rear of 21 College Road and be barely visible from outside the site. This will be partly within the St. Leonards Conservation Area, but due to its location it will not have an adverse impact upon the character or appearance of the main building which is Locally Listed or the Conservation Area.

Subject to the receipt of additional information in respect of car parking and staff travel arrangements; and details of landscaping; the proposals are considered to be acceptable, subject to numerous conditions.

DELEGATION BRIEFING - 23 FEBRUARY 2016

After looking at the proposed plans at the Delegation Briefing and considering the representations received, Members determined that the plans should be considered by the Planning Committee following a Site Visit at their meeting on 14 March 2016.

MEMBER SITE VISIT - 1 MARCH 2016

Members, after viewing the location of the new extensions from within the grounds and from College Road, considered the proposals to be acceptable.

RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to the following conditions:

- 1) C05 - Time Limit - Commencement
- 2) The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out otherwise than in strict accordance with the submitted details received by the Local Planning Authority on 18 December 2015 (*dwg. no(s). 6777-BDP-XX-XX-PL-90004; -Z1-00-GA-0001; -Z1-*

01-GA-0002; -Z1-02-GA-0003; -Z1-03-GA-0004; -Z1-XX-EL-0002; and Z2-XX-EL-0010), as modified by other conditions of this consent.

Reason: In order to ensure compliance with the approved drawings.

- 3) Samples of the materials it is intended to use externally in the construction of the development shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority and the development shall not be started before their approval is obtained in writing and the materials used in the construction of the development shall correspond with the approved samples in all respects.
Reason: To ensure that the materials conform with the visual amenity requirements of the area.
- 4) No construction/demolition work shall take place outside the following times: 8am to 6pm (Mondays to Fridays) 8am to 1 pm (Saturdays) nor at any time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.
Reason: In the interests of residential amenity.
- 5) No development shall take place until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. The statement should include details of access arrangements, heavy vehicle routing, timings and management of arrivals and departures of vehicles and any proposed restrictions to pedestrian movement in the vicinity of the site. The approved Statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period.
Reason: In the interests of highway safety and public amenity (Prior to commencement it is recommended that the developer consults, and if necessary meets with, the Highway Authority to establish a safe means of progress).
- 6) Before the commencement of the development hereby approved details of all building services plant, including sound power levels and predicted sound pressure levels at a specified location outside the building envelope, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, and shall be demonstrated by measurement prior to the occupation of the development.
Reason: To protect the residential amenities of adjacent residential occupiers.
- 7) No part of the three storey extension hereby approved shall be brought into its intended use until;
(a) the existing car parking areas have been replanned and lined in accordance with a revised layout that shall have previously been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority and shall thereafter retained for parking purposes in connection with the use of the property; and (b) a staff travel plan, to encourage and raise awareness of the alternative transport options available when travelling to work, has been submitted to and agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
Reason: To ensure that adequate facilities are available for the traffic attracted to the site and staff are encouraged to use alternative modes of transport to the private car on journeys to and from work.
- 8) A detailed scheme for landscaping, including the planting of trees and/or shrubs and the use of surface materials in accordance with an agreed programme, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority before the occupation of the three storey extension to the property. The landscaping shall thereafter be implemented in accordance with the approved scheme in accordance with the agreed programme.
Reason: In the interests of amenity.
- 9) Before the occupation of any part of the three storey extension hereby approved, a scheme for lighting the inside and outside of the public areas to the building and its perimeter, including the installation of presence detectors and timers, shall be

installed in accordance with details which shall have previously been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. These shall be permanently retained thereafter unless otherwise approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing.

Reason: To protect the residential amenities of adjacent occupiers.

Local Government (Access to Information) 1985 (as amended).

Background papers used in compiling the report:

Files of planning applications available for inspection from the Customer Service Centre, Civic Centre, Paris Street, Exeter: Telephone 01392 265223